

Short Communication

**Investigating the existent equations for prediction of maximum scouring
depth of side piers using decision tree approach**

Hamed Nayebi¹, Mohammad Shirvani^{2*} and Mahdi Kamfiroozi³

¹Department of Water Engineering, Faculty of Technology and Engineering,
Bandar Abbas Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bandar Abbas, Iran.

²Sama Technical and Vocational Training College,
Islamic Azad University, Bandar Abbas Branch, Bandar Abbas, Iran.

³Sama Technical and Vocational Training College, Islamic Azad University,
Bandar Abbas Branch, Bandar Abbas, Iran.

*Corresponding Author: Mohammad Shirvani

ABSTRACT

Scouring is a main cause of bridges breaking. Hence, prediction of scouring depth has been always one of the most important subjects of study. Several studies have been conducted to find an equation for prediction of scouring depth of side piers. Most of the mentioned studies are faced to some errors to predict scouring depth due to complication of scouring issue. In the present study, scouring of piers has been investigated using decision tree approach. At the beginning of the study, experimental data have been extracted using previous studies. Then, existent equations have been investigated and compared using the extracted data. The equations showed that, Hire's equation (1995) has a higher precision when L/y is small, for high piers and when V/V_c is less than 1 as well as for small L/d_{50} .

Keywords: Depth of Scouring, Side Pier, Decision Tree.

1. INTRODUCTION

Most of bridge breakings occur once flood occurrence. Flood can cause collapse of structure by erosion around piers. Therefore, scouring can be considered as a cause of bridges breaking. In the present study, it has been attempted to investigate scouring around side piers. The piers cause to generate some vortices by blocking the flow path and changing them. The mentioned vortices are the main cause of scouring around the piers. Finding a way to estimate depth of scouring is important engineers' concerns. Most of empirical equations on the scouring of side piers have been created using dimensionless parameters. In continue, the types of scouring

have been investigated and finally have been evaluated using decision tree approach.

1- General scouring: it occurs at two states including A) where the river has not been balanced, and sediment transport potential in a reach is higher than the amount of input sediment to this reach. B) Where flow velocity is increased due to some causes such as reduction of the river cross-section at the bridges' location. Scouring occurs in the narrow section of the river.

2- Local scouring: it occurs where turbulences are increased locally. Local scouring occurs downstream of hydraulic structures such as spillway, shot, valves and piers due to a higher local velocity than critical velocity which occurs

because of flow gradient variation and increase of velocity around the structure, and turning the velocity head to pressure head caused by hitting the flow to the structure and consequently flow conduction toward downstream and creation of meandering flows in downstream.

2. Characteristics of Decision Tree

Decision tree places input data in different categories so that, no input data is eliminated. Although some patterns of decision trees may be complicated, understanding of the model of tree and analytical results is easy. Categorizations in decision tree are conducted according to similarity of the input data in predictor parameters. A decision tree is in the form of upside down tree so that, there is a root on top of that, and the leaves are at the bottom. The leaves

are actually the output regulations and equations which help predicting the discussed subject. Considering complication and the nature of scouring, decision tree is used in the present study to predict the amount of scouring depth.

3. MATERIALS AND METHODS

Several experiments have been conducted on scouring of side piers. A number of experiments have been collected which form a complete set of various laboratory states. In each experiment, some parameters such as water depth, length of pier, depth of scouring, median diameter of sediment, standard deviation of the sediments size, density of sediment (ρ_s) and shape of pier have been reported. Erosion depth measured in the data is the erosion depth at balance state.

Table1. Number and range of the data

	Number	Foundation type	d_{50} (mm)	σ_g	ρ_s	V/V_e	L/y
Abouseida(2009)	24	Vertical	0.38	1.7	-	0.33-0.95	0.62-1.27
Ballio(2009)	25	Vertical	1.9-5	1.3	2.57	-0.990-0.84	4.05-4.35
Coleman&Melville(2003)	68	Vertical	0.8-1.02	-	-	0.46-0.99	0.25-151.3
Gill(1972)	23	Vertical	0.9	1.2	2.65	0.65-1.49	1.96-8.82
Kwan(1984)	19	Vertical	0.85-0.9	1.3	2.65	0.9-1	1.64-28
Kwan(1984)	5	Winged	0.9	1.3	2.65	1	2.4-9.5
Kandasamy(1989)	30	Winged	0.9	1.3	2.65	0.95-2.25	1-69
Grade(1963)	7	Vertical	0.3-1	-	2.65	0.83-2.15	1.23-2.06
Lim(1997)	11	Vertical	0.94	1.25	2.65	0.41-0.74	0.33-1
Rajaratnam(1983)	6	Vertical	1.4	1.3	2.65	0.4-0.67	0.99-1.43
Liu(1961)	4	Vertical	0.56-0.64	1.17	2.65	0.5-0.94	2-3.75
Cunha(1995)	7	Vertical	1.6-5.8	-	-	0.45-0.94	2.2
Tey(1984)	8	Vertical- Semicircle	0.8-0.9	1.26	2.65	0.78-1	1.65-6
Ladage(1998)	4	Vertical	0.8	-	-	0.49-0.7	0.75
Dongol(1990)	46	Vertical-Winged	0.9	1.3	2.65	1-6.4	0.25-1.5
Dongol(1994)	119	Vertical- Winged	0.9-18	1.3	2.65	0.76-4	0.25-151.3
Dey&Barbhuiya(2004)	449	Vertical- Winged- Semicircle	0.26-3.1	1.17-1.38	2.65	0.95	0.16-2.4
Total	885	Vertical- Winged- Semicircle	0.26-18	1.17-1.38	2.57-2.65	0.33-4	0.16-151.3

4. Data analysis in prediction equations

In table2, the equations of estimation of scouring depth and their limitations have been presented. In the mentioned equations, Fr is Froude number of flow ($Fr=V/\sqrt{yg}$), g is acceleration of gravity, X is the

distance of piers, F_c is critical Froude number, Δ is equal to $\rho_s/\rho-1$, ρ_s is density of sediments and ρ is density of water.

Table2. Equations given for estimation of scouring depth

Reference	Equation	Limitation	Number
Froehlich (1989) Hire (1995)	$y_s/y=2.27K_1K_2(L/y)^{0.43}Fr^{0.61}+1$ $y_s/y=(4/0.55)K_1K_2Fr^{0.33}$	$L/y<25$ $L/y>25$	(1-2) (2-2)
Al-Saadi (2013)	$y_s/L=81.41Fr^{-5.1}$	Clear Water	(3-2)
Laursen (1963)	$y_s/y=1.89(L/y)^{0.5}$	Clear Water	(4-2)
Melville (1997)	$y_s=K_1K_2K_3K_4K_5K_6K_7K_8$	-	(5-2)
Dey&Barbhuiya (2004) Vertical base Winged base 45 ° Semicircle base	$y_s/L=3.857Fc^{0.214}(y/L)^{0.126}(L/d_{50})^{0.167}$ $y_s/L=6.484Fc^{0.212}(y/L)^{0.101}(L/d_{50})^{0.231}$ $y_s/L=7.287Fc^{0.192}(y/L)^{0.103}(L/d_{50})^{0.246}$	$L/y<1$	(A6-2) (B6-2) (C6-2)

At the first step, variations of difference relative to the logarithmic variations of dimensionless pier length have been evaluated to the flow depth which represents the amount of pier height. Equation (1-2) is for short piers and equation (2-2) is for high piers. This method has predicted 7.28 times higher at the worst state. In equation (2-3), it is observed that, it has predicted 5.79 times higher at the worst state. Equation (4-2) has predicted 8.12 times higher at the worst state. By increasing the amount of $\log(L/y)$, precision of prediction is decreased and the equation overestimates. Equation (5-2) has predicted 4.7 times higher at the worst state. Equation (6-2) has predicted the scouring 8.03 times higher at the worst state.

At the second step, variations of dR variations relative to logarithmic variations of flow velocity have been evaluated. With regard to the equations (1- 2), (2-2) and (3-2), it is observed that, by increasing the ratio of $V/\log V_c$, precision of the equations is decreased. With regard to the equation (4-2), it is observed that, by increasing the ratio of $V/\log V_c$, precision of the equation is decreased. Equation (5- 2) has an acceptable precision at live bed state. Equation (6-2) states that, its precision is increased by the increase of $V/\log V_c$. At the third step, variations of dR ratio were evaluated relative to logarithmic variations

of sediment diameter. In equations (2-1) and (2-2), by increasing the value of $\log(L/d_{50})$, dR is less than 1 and the equation underestimates in this range. In the equation (3-2), by increasing the value of $\log(L/d_{50})$, the prediction precision is still acceptable. In equation (4-4), the precision decreases by increasing the amount of $\log(L/d_{50})$ and the equation overestimates. Equation (6-2) shows that, by increasing the amount of $\log(L/d_{50})$, the prediction precision is highly reduced.

5. CONCLUSION

At the first step, variations of difference relative to the logarithmic variations of dimensionless pier length has been evaluated to the flow depth, it was found that, when L/y is low, the equation (5-2) has higher precision for high piers than the other equations. Then, investigation of dR variations to the ratio of logarithmic variations of flow velocity to the critical velocity showed that, equation (5-2) acts better when V/V_c is less than 1, as well as the equation (3-2) has a higher precision for live bed. Finally, the equations were investigated while variations of dR were evaluated to the logarithmic variations of pier length to the sediments diameter, and it was concluded that, for the state of small L/d_{50} , equation (5-2) has a higher precision than the

other equations, and the equation (3-2) acts better than the other equations for high L/d_{50} .

REFERENCES

- 1) Abou-Seida, M, M, Elsaed, G, H, Mostafa, T, M, S, Elzahry, E, F, M, 2009, Experimental Investigation of Abutment Scour in Sandy Soil. *Journal of Applied Sciences Research*, 5(1): 57-65.
- 2) Al-Saadi, S, I, K, Abbass, R, O, 2013 ,Development of empirical formula for effect of circular pier and abutment on local scour depth Kufa journal of engineering Vol 4, number 2, pp 69-86.
- 3) Azamathulla, H.M., 2012. Gene-expression programming to predict scour at a bridge abutment. *Journal of Hydro informatics*, 14 (2), 324–331.
- 4) Ballio, F, Teruzzi, A, Radice, A 2009 Constriction Effects in Clear-Water Scour at Abutments. *J. Hydraul. Eng., Am. Soc. Civ. Eng.*135:140-145.
- 5) Begum, S.A., Fujail, A.K.M., and Barbhuiya, A.K., 2012. Artificial neural network to predict equilibrium local scour depth around semicircular bridge abutments. 6thSASTech 2012, 24–25 March 2012, Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.
- 6) Brandimarte, L., Paron, P., and Di baldassarre, G., 2012. Bridge pier scour: a review of processes, measurements and estimates. *Environmental Engineering and Management Journal*, 11 (5), 975–989.
- 7) Breusers, H.N.C., 1966, Conformity and time scale in two-dimensional local scour, proceeding symposium on model and prototype conformity, Hydraulic Research Laboratory, Poona, P.1-8.
- 8) Buckingham, E. 1914. "On physically similar systems; illustrations of the use of dimensional equations". *Physical Review*4 (4): 345–376.
- 9) Dey S, Barbhuiya A K 2004 Local scour at abutments: A review. *S adhana* Vol. 29, Part 5:449-476.
- 10) Froehlich, D. C. 1989. Local scour at bridge abutments. *Proc. Natl. Conf. Hydraulic Engineering (New Orleans, LA: Am. Soc. Civil Eng.)* 13–18.
- 11) Kwan, T.F. 1984, Study of abutment scour.Rep.No. 328, School of Engineering, University of Auckland, Auckland, New Zealand.
- 12) Kwan, T, F, Melville, B, W, 1994, Local scour and flow measurements at bridge abutments. *J. Hydraul. Res.* 32: 661–673.
- 13) Ladage, F. 1998. Temporal development of local scour at bridge abutments. Internal report, University of Auckland, Auckland, New Zealand.
- 14) Laursen, E. M.1963. An analysis of Relief Bridge scour. *J. Hydraul. Div., Am. Soc. Civ. Eng.*89: 93–118.
- 15) Laursen, E. M, Toch, A, 1956. Scour around bridge piers and abutments. *Bull. No. 4, Iowa Highways Research Board, Ames, Iowa.*
- 16) Li H, Kuhnle R A, Bark doll, B, D, 2006 COUNTERMEASURES AGAINST SCOUR AT ABUTMENTS. Channel and Watershed Processes Research Unit.
- 17) Lim, S, Y, 1997 Equilibrium clear-water scour around an abutment. *J. Hydraul. Eng., Am. Soc. Civ. Eng.* 123: 237–243.
- 18) Liu, H. K., Chang, F. M. and Skinner, M. M. 1961, Effect of bridge construction on scour and backwater. CER 60 HKL 22, Colorado State University, Civil Engineering Section, Fort Collins, Colorado.
- 19) Lombard P J and Hodgkins G A 2008 Comparison of Observed and Predicted Abutment Scour at Selected Bridges in Maine U.S. Geological Survey Scientific Investigations Report 2008–5099, 23 p.
- 20) Melville, B. W. and Sutherland, A. J. 1988, Design method for local scour at bridge

- piers. J. Hydraul. Eng., Am. Soc. Civ. Eng.114: 1210–1226.
- 21) Mohammad pour R, Ghani A & Azamathulla H M 2013 Estimation of dimension and time variation of local scour at short abutment International Journal of River Basin Management, 11:1,121-135.
 - 22) Rajaratnam, N. and Nwachukwu, B. A.1983. Flow near groin-like structures. J. Hydraul. Eng., Am. Soc. Civ.Eng. 109: 463–480.
 - 23) Richardson E V, Davis S R 2001 Evaluating scour at bridges. HEC18 FHWA NHI-001, Federal Highway Administration, US Department of Transportation, Washington, DC.
 - 24) Shields, A, F, 1936, Application of similarity principles and turbulence research to bed-load movement, vol 26. Mitteilungen der Preussischen Versuchsanstalt für Wasserbau und Schiffbau Berlin, Germany, pp 5–24.
 - 25) Tey, C. B.1984, Local scour at bridge abutments. Rep. No. 329, School of Engineering, University of Auckland, Auckland, New Zealand.
 - 26) Van Rijn, L.C. 1986. Sedimentation of dredged channels by currents and waves, Journal of Waterway, Port, Coastal and Ocean Engineering, ASCE, 112 (5).
 - 27) White, F 2011.Fluid Mechanics, 7th Edition, McGraw-Hill Science/Engineering/Math.
 - 28) Wong, W. H.1982. Scour at bridge abutments. Rep. No. 275, School of Engineering, University of Auckland, New Zealand.